

**Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review
Meeting of May 2, 2024**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Shirley Goebel Christie
Deborah Stuhlweissenburg
Joseph Milillo
Matt Miller
Sharon Burke
Brian Aitcheson

MEMBERS ABSENT: none

ALSO, PRESENT: Brittany Cordero, Deputy Town Attorney,
Elizabeth Decort, Secretarial Assistant II, and Gerard Chesterman, Planning
Assistant

Shirley Goebel Christie called the meeting to order at 7:31 p.m.
Ms. Goebel Christie read the agenda. Hearings as listed on this meeting's
agenda, which are made a part of these minutes, were held as noted below.

New Items:

Subaru Distribution Sign Plan **ACABOR #24-19**
Review of Sign Plan
6 Ramland Road, Orangeburg **Approved as**
Section; 73.20, Block 1, **Presented**
Lots 23 & 25; LIO zoning district

SMK Erie West Subdivision – Lot 20.4 **ACABOR #24-20**
Review of the Site/Structure
26 Del Regno Court, Blauvelt **Approved as**
Section 70.13, Block 1, **Presented**
Lot 20.4; R-15 zoning district

39 South Williams Street Plans **ACABOR #24-21**
Review of the Site/Structure
39 South Williams Street, Pearl River **Approved with**
Section 68.20, Block 1, **Conditions**
Lot 30.2; CS zoning district

South Orangetown Ambulance Corps. Plans **ACABOR #24-22**
Review of Site/Structure Plans
70 Independence Avenue, Tappan **Approved With**
Section 74.18, Block 3, **Options**
Lots 39 & 40; R-15 zoning district

Bright Path Kids Plans **ACABOR #24-23**
Review of Structure/Site Plans
249 North Middletown Road, **Continuation**
Pearl River
Section 68.12, Block 3,
Lot 27; CO zoning district

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2024 MAY 28 PM 2:08
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

**Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review
Meeting of May 2, 2024**

A motion was made to adjourn the meeting by Shirley Goebel Christie and second by Deborah Stuhlweissenburg and agreed by all in attendance. The Decisions on the above hearings, which Decisions are made by the Board before the conclusion of the meeting, are mailed to the applicant. As there was no further business before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 9:18 p.m.

Dated: May 2, 2024

Gerard Chesterman, Town of Orangetown



TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

2024 MAY 28 P 2:08

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

**ACABOR #24-19
Subaru Distribution Sign Plan
Approved as Presented**

Permit # Sign-45782-24

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision
May 2, 2024
Page 1 of 2**

**TO: Rick Bohlander, 120 Bedford Road, Armonk, New York
10504**

**FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review**

RE: Subaru Distribution Sign Plan: The application of Subaru Distribution Corp. owner for the review of Sign Plans for two signs at a site to be known as “**Subaru Distribution Sign Plan**” in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at Subaru Distribution Center, Orangeburg, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section; 73.20, Block 1, Lots 23 & 25; LIO zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, May 2, 2024** at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Joe Modafferri, Project Manager from JMC Planning, Engineering, Landscape Architecture & Land Surveying, PLLC, appeared and testified. The Board received the following items:

A. Sign inventory, prepared by Philadelphia Signs, dated April 17, 2023, last revised August 24, 2023:

- N01: Chrome Logo
- N02: “SUBARU” Channel Letters
- N03: 2019 Chrome Logo
- N04: “SUBARU” Channel Letters
- N05: “Training Center” Letters
- N06: SUBARU Sign
- N07: Logo and Letter Cross Section

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2024 MAY 28 P 2:08
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision
May 2, 2024
Page 2 of 2

B. ACABOR Photo Exhibits, prepared by JMC Planning, Engineering, Landscape Architecture & Land Surveying, PLLC, dated February 12, 2024.

C. Site Layout Plan, prepared by JMC Planning, Engineering, Landscape Architecture & Land Surveying, PLLC, dated February 1, 2017, last revised February 6, 2024.

D. Building Department Referral, dated February 26, 2024, prepared by Rick Oliver, Chief Building Inspector.

E. Zoning Board of Appeals Decision #24-22, dated April 3, 2024; Refers to LO District, Column 5#11 Size of Signs Variance.

F. Material Sheet prepared by Applicant.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that two signs would be installed; one sign would be installed on a renovated existing building and the second sign would be to identify the Training Center. The signage would consist of blue Channel Letters and the logo would be chrome and blue, as noted on the submitted plan.

2. The Board found that no new landscaping is being proposed as part of this application, landscaping had been previously installed as phase one of the project.

The hearing was then opened to the Public.

There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved as Presented**.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Shirley Goebel Christie and second by Deborah Stuhlweissenburg and carried as follows; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye; Deborah Stuhlweissenburg, aye; Brian Aitcheson, aye; Matthew Miller, aye; Sharon Burke, aye; Sharon Burke aye; and Joseph Milillo, aye.

The Clerk is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: May 2, 2024

Gerard Chesterman, Town of Orangetown



TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

2024 MAY 28 P 2:08

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

**ACABOR #24-20
SMK Erie West Subdivision – Lot 20.4
Approved as Presented**

Permit # BLDR-4962-24

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision
May 2, 2024
Page 1 of 2**

**TO: Sean Keenan, 1 Tweed Boulevard, Nyack, New York
10960**

**FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review**

RE: PB #24-20: SMK Erie West Subdivision – Lot 20.4: The application of SMK Home Builders, owner, for the review of plans located in the SMK Erie West Subdivision, known as Lot #20.4, “**SMK Erie West Subdivision – Lot 20.4**” in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 26 Del Regno Court, Blauvelt, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Town of Orangetown Tax Map as Section 70.13, Block 1, Lot 20.4; R-15 zoning district

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, May 2, 2024** at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Kier Levesque R.A. appeared and testified. The Board received the following items:

- A.** Landscape Plan prepared by Steve Griggs Design, dated November 25, 2023.
- B.** Architectural Plans, prepared by Kier B. Levesque, R.A. Architect, dated March 25, 2024, revised as noted:
 - A-2: First Floor Plan
 - A-3: Second Floor Plans
 - A-4: Elevations, revised May 2, 2024
 - A-5: Elevations, revised May 2, 2024
- C.** Site Development Plan, prepared by Jay A. Greenwell, PLS, LLC., dated March 25, 2024.

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2024 MAY 28 P 2:08
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision
May 2, 2024
Page 2 of 2

- D. Material Sheet and material list, prepared by Kier B. Levesque, R.A.
- E. Renderings of proposed house.
- F. Building Department Referral, dated April 3, 2024, prepared by Rick Oliver, Chief Building Inspector.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the house would have four sides of Sterling Grey vinyl siding with decorative shingle siding on the front elevation peaks, manufactured by Certainteed, or equal. The trim, porch railing and posts would be PVC/composite in white, and as shown on the submitted elevation plans.
2. The Board found that the roofing would be charcoal color manufactured by GAF Timberline, or equal. The windows would be white and manufactured by Pella, or equal.
3. The Board found that there would be black exterior coach lights at the sliding door and garage door, in accordance with Town code.
4. The Board found that the front walkway would consist of grey pavers and the air conditioning would be placed near the exterior garage stairs.

The hearing was then opened to the Public.

There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved as Presented**.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Deborah Stuhlweissenburg and second by Joseph Milillo and carried as follows; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye; Brian Aitcheson, aye; Matthew Miller, aye; Sharon Burke, aye; Debbie Stuhlweissenburg, aye; and, Joseph Milillo, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this **Decision** and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: May 2, 2024
Gerard Chesterman, Town of Orangetown

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

2024 MAY 28 P 2:08

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

**ACABOR #24-21
39 South Williams Street Plans
Approved with Conditions**

Permit # BLDC 2402-22

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision
May 2, 2024
Page 1 of 3**

TO: Ed O’Hara, 961 McLean Avenue APT 260, Yonkers, New York 10706

FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: 39 South Williams Street Plans: The application of Ed O’Hara, owner, for the review of Plans at a site to be known as “**39 South Williams Street Plans**” in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 39 South William Street, Pearl River, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section; 68.20, Block 1, Lot 30.2; CS zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, May 2, 2024** at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Ed O’Hara, owner, appeared and testified. The Board received the following items:

A. Architectural Plans, prepared by Jenny R. Zuniga-Casal, Architect, dated August 4, 2022, last revised January 17, 2024:

- A-1: Wall types, Plumbing Diagram, CMU Wall Detail and Wood Frame Details
- A-2: first Floor Plan, Access Aisle at Passenger Loading Zone, Lighting Plan @1st Floor
- A-3: 2nd Floor and Lighting Plans
- A-4: Roof Plan and Attic Floor Plan
- A-5: Elevations Typical Stair Detail and Window and Door Schedules
- A-6: Cross Sections
- A-7: Cross Sections
- A-8: Coss Sections

B. C-2-Layout Plan prepared by Hudson Engineering & Consulting, dated January 23, 2024.

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2024 MAY 28 P 2:09
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision
May 2, 2024
Page 2 of 3**

- C. Project Narrative and Material Sheet, prepared by the Applicant.
- D. Specification Sheet of Andersen Windows & Doors, 200 Series and a Specification Sheet .
- E. Copies of Board Decisions: Zoning Board of Appeals #24-18, Number of Parking Spaces Required and Side Yard, Total Side Yard and Rear Yard Variances Approved, dated March 20, 2024 and Planning Board Decision #23-46, Preliminary Site Plan Approval Subject to Conditions, dated January 10, 2024.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the proposed construction would be a two-story building that would house construction storage on the first floor and have office spaces on the second floor.
2. The Board found that the building exteriors consisted of brick on the east side/ front of the building and with split faced concrete masonry units (CMU) on the sides and rear elevations. The brick would be manufactured by Watsonstown Brick Company in Fort Heritage color in jumbo size style, or equal.
3. The Board found that the roof shingles would be manufactured by Owens Corning, or equal, in Onyx Black. The windows would be Anderson 200 series, or equal, in white.
4. The Board found that the front of the building would have 2 exterior lights, while the back would have 1 exterior light, in accordance with Town code. Also, there would be HVAC units at the rear of the building. The Board requested that the units be screened with 6 Boxwood plantings. The Layout Plan should be revised.
5. The Board found that there would be a small landscape area at the front of the building. The Board requested that the applicant plant 4 Boxwood plants and 3 Skip Laurels plants, as agreed upon and hand written on the Layout Plan. The Layout Plan should be revised.

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2024 MAY 28 P 2:09
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision
May 2, 2024
Page 3 of 3

The hearing was then opened to the Public.

Public Comment:

Andy McKeon, abutting property owner, 42 Ridge Street and 35 South William Street, Pearl River, questioned the elevation of the building if there would be side windows.

There being no one else to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved with the Following Conditions:**

1. The Layout Plan shall be revised to include the following:
At the rear of the building, the HVAC units shall be screened with 6 Boxwood plantings, and in the front yard landscaped area, 4 Boxwood plants and 3 Skip Laurels plants shall be planted.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Joseph Milillo and second by Brian Aitcheson and carried as follows; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye; Deborah Stuhlweissenburg, aye; Brian Aitcheson, aye; Matthew Miller, aye; Sharon Burke, aye; Sharon Burke aye; and Joseph Milillo, Aye.

The Clerk is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this **Decision** and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: May 2, 2024
Gerard Chesterman, Town of Orangetown



TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2024 MAY 28 P 2:09
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

ACABOR #24-22
South Orangetown Ambulance Corps. Plans
Approved with Options

Permit # 49091

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision
May 2, 2024
Page 1 of 4

TO: Donald Brenner, 4 Independence Avenue, Tappan, New York 10983

FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: **South Orangetown Ambulance Corps. Plans:** The application of South Orangetown Ambulance Corps, owner, for the review of plans at a site known as “**South Orangetown Ambulance Corps. Plans**” in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 70 Independence Avenue, Tappan, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section; 74.18, Block 3, Lots 39 & 40; R-15 zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, May 2, 2024** at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Kier Levesque, of Kier B. Levesque, R.A. Architect, Donald Brenner, Attorney, and Peter Roimisher, Chief of Ambulance for South Orangetown Ambulance Corp. appeared and testified. The Board received the following items:

A. Architectural plans, prepared by Kier B. Levesque, R.A., dated May 1, 2019, last revised dated May 4, 2023:

- A-2: First Floor Plan: Existing and New
- A-3: First Floor Plan: Existing Operations & Garage
- A-4: Floor Plan: New Garage
- A-5: Second Floor Plan: Existing Office & Training
- A-6 Second Floor Plan: Rest Rooms & Meeting Room
- A-7: Elevations
- A-8: Elevations

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2024 MAY 28 PM 2:09
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision
May 2, 2024
Page 2 of 4

B. Site Plans prepared by Jay A. Greenwell, PLS:

- 1 of 5: Site Plan for Proposed Addition, dated October 23, 2018, last revised March 5, 2024
- 2 of 5: Grading, Drainage & Utility Plan with Soil Control, dated October 23, 2018, last revised March 5, 2024
- 3 of 5: Details, dated November 20, 2018, last revised August 8, 2023

C. Plans prepared by Yost Design Landscape Architecture, dated February 14, 2019:

- 4 of 5 (L-101): Landscaping Plan, last revised November 1, 2023
- 5 of 5 (L-601): Lighting Plan, last revised August 14, 2023

D. Project Narrative, Material Sheet and Color Renderings of the proposed building design, submitted by the applicant.

E. Copies of Board Decisions: Zoning Board of Appeals #23-24, Floor Area Ratio, Front Yard, Side Yard, Total Side Yard, Rear Yard, Building Height and Parking Variances Approved with Specific Conditions, dated January 17, 2024 and Planning Board #19-67, Preliminary Site Plan Approval Subject to Conditions, dated October 25, 2023.

F. Email from Matt Wolf dated May 1, 2024.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the South Orangetown Ambulance Corps proposed the construction of an addition on the south side of the existing South Orangetown Ambulance Corp Building.
2. The Board found that the addition would have vinyl siding, in country Beige, manufactured by Market Square, or equal. The siding would match the siding on the existing building. The new dormer shutters would be light blue and match the existing shutter color.
3. The Board found that the proposed garage bay doors would be white and match the 2 existing garage doors. The windows would be white and manufactured by Anderson, or equal. The trim would also be white.
4. The Board found that 1 LED wall light would be placed on the southeast side of the building and 2 LED 10' high pole lights would be added to the parking area.

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2024 MAY 28 P 2:10
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision
May 2, 2024
Page 3 of 4

5. The Board found that the fence at the existing emergency generator would be replaced with a new Acoustafence sound attenuation screening, or equal, on the northeast side of the property.
6. The Board found that the applicant proposed a 15-car parking lot to the southeast of the proposed addition and lawn space would be placed east of the proposed parking lot.
7. The Board found that landscaping plan to be acceptable.

The hearing was then opened to the Public.

Public Comment:

TJ Muncan, 7 Amy Court, Tappan, noted that his house sits across the street and up hill from the proposed addition, which will be visible from his house. He took issue with the existing lighting on the front of the building, and how they give 180 Degree lighting. He presented photos of the buildings lights to the board and questioned if they would look like this with the new addition and asked for the potential for them to be lowered. Mr. Muncan also stressed that such a large building and parking lot does not belong in a residential area. He then asked if taller evergreens could be placed around the parking lot, to create a buffer.

Teppi Iharada, 7 Amy, Tappan. The expansion will occur directly in front of his house. As a registered nurse, he understands the importance of first responders. He took issue with the proposed 6 bay ambulance building and that it does not fit in with the residential area. He stated that no other ambulance buildings of such size in the Rockland and Bergen County areas that are located in residential neighborhoods.

Ron Shapiro, 100 Leber Road, Blauvelt, appeared and testified. He wanted to clarify that there will be vehicles coming out of all 6 bays and that none will be used for storage.

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

2024 MAY 28 P 2:10

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision
May 2, 2024
Page 4 of 4

There being no one else to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved with the following Options:**

1. The applicant as the option of having the lighting in the front of the building be downward directed, have a lower wattage and be motion detection lights.
2. The applicant has the option of revising the landscape plan to add more screening for the neighbors, and that the use of arborvitaes or evergreens be explored. In the event that the landscaping plan changes, revised plans shall be provided.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Joseph Milillo and second by Sharon Burke and carried as follows; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye; Brian Aitcheson, aye; Matthew Miller, aye; Sharon Burke, aye; Debbie Stuhlweissenburg, aye; and, Joseph Milillo, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this **Decision** and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: May 2, 2024
Gerard Chesterman, Town of Orangetown



TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2024 MAY 28 PM 2:10
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE