

**Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review
Meeting of January 17, 2019**

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Andrew Andrews, Chairman Shirley Goebel Christie Brian Aitcheson
Christopher Dunnigan Deborah Stuhlweissenburg Katie Beckmann

MEMBER ABSENT: John McCullough

ALSO PRESENT: Barbara Gionta, Deputy Town Attorney; Ann Marie Ambrose, Stenographer and Cheryl Coopersmith, Chief Clerk Boards and Commissions

Andrew Andrews, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m.
Mr. Andrews read the agenda. Hearings as listed on this meeting's agenda which are made a part of these minutes were held as noted below.

William Helmke Homes **ACABOR #18 - 60**
Structure/Site and Landscaping Plans **Approved**
Review of Site/Structure/Landscaping Plans **with Conditions**
491 Orangeburg Road, Pearl River
69.18/1/26; R-15 zoning district

Bul Kwang Zen Site Plan **ACABOR #19 - 03**
Landscaping/Site Plan **Approved**
Tappan Historic District **with Conditions**
104 Route 303, Tappan
77.07/1/2; LO zoning district

A motion was made to adjourn the meeting by Katie Beckmann and seconded Deborah Stuhlweissenburg and agreed by all in attendance. The Decisions on the above hearings, which Decisions are made by the Board before the conclusion of the meeting, are mailed to the applicant. The verbatim minutes are not transcribed, but are available. As there was no further business before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 8:30 p.m.

Dated: January 17, 2019
Cheryl Coopersmith
Chief Clerk Boards and Commissions



TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2019 JAN 25 A 9 15
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

**ACABOR #18-60 William Helmke Homes
Structure/Site and Landscaping Plans
Approved Subject to Conditions**

Permit #48236

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review Decision**

**January 17, 2019
Page 1 of 5**

**TO: William Helmke, 97 Duryea Lane, Nanuet,
New York, 10956**
**FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review**

RE: William Helmke Homes Plans: The application of William Helmke, applicant for Tracy Mattei, owner, for the review of structure/site/landscaping plans at a site to be known as “**William Helmke Home Plans**”, in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 491 Orangeburg Road, Pearl River, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 69.18, Block 1, Lot 26 in the R-15 zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at meetings held **Thursday, December 6, 2018, January 3 & 17, 2019**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

December 6, 2018

William Helmke appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

A. Architectural Plans prepared by John Perkins, R.A., dated June 26, 2018, last revision date of July 24, 2018:

- 1 of 6: General Notes & Details
- 2 of 6: General Notes & Specifications
- 3 of 6: Weyerhaeuser 'I' Joist Details
- 4 of 6: Floor Plans, Sections Details
- 5 of 6: Elevations
- 6 of 6: Cellar & First Floor Electrical Plans

B. Site Plan prepared by Robert Sorace, PLS, dated September 21, 2018.

C. Landscape Plan prepared by Edge Landscaping, dated November 25, 2018.

D. A copy of the Building Permit Referral dated October 19, 2018 prepared by Rick Oliver, Building Inspector.

E. Material Specification Sheet.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2019 JAN 25 A 9 15
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review Decision**

**January 17, 2019
Page 2 of 5**

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the house would have four sides of vinyl siding in Natural Clay in a wood grain, manufactured by Certainteed, or equal. Cedar Impressions, or equal, would be placed on the front center façade of the house. The roof would be manufactured by Tamko in Weathered wood, or equal, the trim would be white and the shutters and front door would be Hunter Green.
2. The Board found that the proposed house needed to be redesigned, offering recommendations on the design of the roof and bump outs on the house sides or front.

The hearing was then opened to the Public.

Public Comment:

Joseph Niego, 477 Orangeburg Road, Pearl River, an abutting property owner, raised concerns regarding the appearance of the house, noting that it looked like a railroad apartment house.

Patricia Niego, 477 Orangeburg Road, Pearl River, an abutting property owner, questioned if a smaller house on the lot could be constructed, or start the front of the house at her backyard.

The applicant requested a **Continuation**.

January 3, 2019

William Helmke and John Perkins, R.A. appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

- A. Landscape Plan prepared by Edge Landscaping, dated December 20, 2018.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the proposed house design and placement on the lot is out of character to the neighborhood. The Board requested that the architect redesign the style of the house and façade.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2019 JAN 25 A 9 15
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review Decision**

January 17, 2019

Page 3 of 5

2. The Board found that the applicant should review the possibility of pushing the house further back on the lot. The proposed house presently sits 50 feet from the front property line; the Board suggested that the house be placed an additional 10 to 20 feet further back on the lot.

The Applicant requested a **Continuation**.

January 17, 2019

William Helmke appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

A. Architectural Plans prepared by John Perkins, R.A., dated June 26, 2018, last revision date of January 7, 2019:

- 1 of 6: General Notes & Details
- 2 of 6: General Notes & Specifications
- 3 of 6: Weyerhaeuser 'I' Joist Details
- 4 of 6: Floor Plans, Sections Details
- 5 of 6: Elevations
- 6 of 6: Cellar & First Floor Electrical Plans

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the applicant presented a revised house design that was more in line with the other houses in the neighborhood. The proposed house would have four sides of vinyl siding in Natural Clay in a wood grain, manufactured by Certainteed, or equal. The roof would be manufactured by Tamko in Weathered wood, or equal, the trim would be white and front door would be Hunter Green with a decorative window. The porch would be Trex, or equal, in a wood color and the handrails would be white vinyl.
2. The Board found that the applicant considered moving the house back a few feet, however, that would require obtaining a side yard variance from the Town of Orangetown Zoning Board of Appeals. The Board agreed to have the footprint of the house remain as presented on the Site Plan prepared by Robert Sorace, PLS, dated September 21, 2018.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2019 JAN 25 A 4 15
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review Decision**

**January 17, 2019
Page 4 of 5**

3. The Board found that the proposed Landscaping Plan should be revised to include the following:
 - Change the trees to Green Giant Arborvitae, rather than the proposed Emerald Green Arborvitae.
 - Increase the size of the initial trees to be planted to 6 to 8 feet in height, rather than the proposed 4 to 5 feet in height.
 - Increase the number of trees in the line of trees, as noted on the plan to be planted from 12 to 15 trees. Start planting the trees more towards the driveway and add the additional 3 trees in the line, towards the rear of the yard.
 - Change the Hydrangea plants to some type of grass that would grow to 4-5 feet in height.

Public Comment:

Joseph Niego, 477 Orangeburg Road, Pearl River, an abutting property owner, requested to review the site plan, raising concerns regarding the location of the proposed driveway. He held that the k-turn faces his house and he wanted additional trees planted as well as larger trees. Additionally, Mr. Niego requested that the type of tree be changed Green Giant Arborvitae trees.

Patricia Niego, 477 Orangeburg Road, Pearl River, an abutting property owner, questioned why the proposed driveway was located on her side of the lot. She expressed concerns regarding the landscaping of the site.

There being no one else to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved Subject to the following Conditions:**

1. The revised house design prepared by John Perkins, R.A., dated June 26, 2018, last revision date of January 7, 2019, is more in line with the other houses in the neighborhood. The proposed house will have four sides of vinyl siding in Natural Clay in a wood grain, manufactured by Certainteed, or equal. The roof will be manufactured by Tamko in Weathered wood, or equal, the trim will be white and front door will be Hunter Green with a decorative window. The porch will be Trex, or equal, in a wood color and the handrails will be white vinyl.

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2019 JAN 25 A 9:15
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review Decision

January 17, 2019

Page 5 of 5

2. The proposed Landscaping Plan shall be revised to include the following:
 - Change the trees to **Green Giant Arborvitae**, rather than the proposed Emerald Green Arborvitae.
 - Increase the size of the initial trees to be planted to **6 to 8 feet in height**, rather than the proposed 4 to 5 feet in height.
 - Increase the **number of trees in the line of trees, as noted on the plan to be planted from 12 to 15 trees**. Start planting the trees more towards the driveway and add the additional 3 trees in the line, towards the rear of the yard.
 - Change the Hydrangea plants to some type of **grass that would grow to 4-5 feet in height**.
3. The house siding shall be brought down to 8 inches above grade, on all four sides of the house.
4. The Board found exterior lights will be placed in accordance with Town Code, downward shining and the fixtures would be in coach style.
5. Trees to be saved shall be protected with snow fencing to the drip line during construction.
6. No grading is to take place within five feet of any property line, except as specified on the approved site plan.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Deborah Stuhlweissenburg and seconded by Shirley Goebel Christie and carried as follows: Andrew Andrews, Chairman, aye; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye; Deborah Stuhlweissenburg, aye; Christopher Dunnigan, aye; Katie Beckmann, nay; Brian Aitcheson, aye, and John McCullough, absent.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this *Decision* and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: January 17, 2019
Cheryl Coopersmith
Chief Clerk Boards and Commissions



TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2019 JAN 25 A 9:15
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

**ACABOR #19-03: Bul Kwang Zen Site Plan
Landscaping/Site Plan
Approved with Conditions**

Permit #47484

**Town of Orangetown
Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision
January 17, 2019
Page 1 of 2**

**TO: Jonathan Hodosh, R.A., 60 South Main Street, New City,
New York, 10956**
FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: Bul Kwang Zen Center Site Plan: The application Bul Kwang Sa, Inc., owner, for the review of Site Plans at a site known as “**Bul Kwang Zen Center Site Plan**”, located in the Tappan Historic District, accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 104 Route 303, Tappan, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 77.07, Block 1, Lot 2 in the LO zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, January 17, 2019**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Jonathan Hodosh and Sarah Hollerman appeared and testified. The Board received the following items:

A. Plans prepared by Atzl, Nasher & Zigler, dated December 13, 2017, last revised January 9, 2019:

- Sheet 1: Site Plan
- Sheet 2: Grading Plan
- Sheet 3: Erosion & Sediment Control Plan

B. Architectural Plans prepared by George Hodosh Associates, dated February 22, 2017, last revised December 21, 2018.

C. Material Specification Sheet.

D. A Project Narrative prepared by George Hodosh Associates.

E. A copy of HABR #18-19, dated January 8, 2019, Approved as Modified.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the site was located in the Tappan Historic Area and that review of the building plans were reviewed by the Town of Orangetown Historic Areas Board of Review; HABR #18-19, dated January 8, 2019, Approved as Modified. ACABOR reviewed only the Site/Landscaping Plan.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2019 JAN 25 A 9 15
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

**Town of Orangetown
Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision
January 17, 2019
Page 2 of 2**

2. The Board found that in regard to the landscaping, the site is existing and minimal landscaping is proposed, allowing the surrounding wooded areas to stand out for a natural feel. The front (parking lot side) of the proposed building addition would be near the concrete sidewalk, and the existing planter near the building entrance would be restored after construction. The rear of the addition would be landscaped with lawn only as currently exists in that area.
3. The Board found that the air conditioning units and transformer on site need to be screened, suggesting Boxwood plants or any type of deer resistant plants that would be high enough to cover the units.

The hearing was then opened to the Public.

Mary Cardenus, Orangetown Town Historian, residing at Pine Tree Lane, Tappan; expressed concerns regarding the applicant's intentions of removing the stand of trees near the Chrysler site.

There being no one else to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved Subject to the following Conditions:**

1. The air conditioning units and transformer shall be screened with Boxwood plants or any type of deer resistant plants that will be high enough to cover the units.
2. Trees to be saved shall be protected with snow fencing to the drip line during construction.
3. No grading is to take place within five feet of any property line, except as specified on the approved site plan.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Katie Beckmann and seconded by Christopher Dunnigan and carried as follows:
Andrew Andrews, Chairman, aye; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye;
Deborah Stuhlweissenburg, aye; Christopher Dunnigan, aye; Katie Beckmann, aye; Brian Aitcheson, aye, and John McCullough, absent.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this **Decision** and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

**Dated: January 17, 2019
Cheryl Coopersmith
Chief Clerk Boards and Commissions**

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

2019 JAN 25 A 9 15

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN