

**MINUTES  
HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW  
November 12, 2019**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Margaret Raso, Chair  
Scott Wheatley  
Loren Plotkin  
Larry Bucciarelli  
Carol Schelin  
Thano Schoppel

ABSENT: William Walther

ALSO PRESENT: Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide  
Dennis Michaels, Deputy Town Attorney  
Anne Marie Ambrose, Official Stenographer

Margaret Raso, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. Hearings on this meeting's agenda, which are made a part of this meeting, were held as noted below:

APPLICANTS

DECISION

HABR#

**OTHER BUSINESS:**

CAROL STEWART, 696 Oak Tree Road, Palisades, New York referred to HABR for a fireplace installation that was applied for in 2009; when re-newing the permit the applicant was referred to HABR; Sarah Stewart, acting on behalf of her mother spoke to Larry Bucciarelli, her mothers' neighbor and appeared at the meeting as "Other Business": **the Board stated that they have never reviewed an interior fireplace or its flue ( that it is not in their purview to review interior work or any flue needed for interior fireplaces gas or wood burning) and that the applicant does not need to appear before them.**

**Margaret Raso made a motion that the applicant does not need to appear before the Historic Areas Board of Review for the fireplace flue; which motion was seconded by Thano Schoppel and carried unanimously.**

HEAVEN TOO TRUST AMENDMENT TO  
40 Washington Spring Road  
Palisades, NY  
78.19 / 1 / 13; R-22 zoning district

HABR#19-11  
Permit# 48773

Meg Fowler, Architect stated that they have made some modifications to the approved cabana and gym for financial reasons; that the gym will have glass sliders instead of the approved custom built wood and glass barn doors; that the cupola has been removed; that the kitchen and bathroom in the cabana has been reduced in size and the interior has more open space; that these interior changes allowed for changes to windows and the original five panel door is being replaced with 4 panel sliders; that the Juliet Balcony is remaining and the ironwork is being re-used.

Scott Wheatley made a motion to accept the minor changes to HABR 19-11; which motion was seconded by Thano Schoppel and carried unanimously.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN  
2019 NOV 27 A 9:03  
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

Minutes  
Page 2

HABR#19-18: Cheer Hall house: Henry Rust, Architect was appearing for Cheer Hall  
HABR#19-20 the garage and asked the Board to look at the railing plan that they have decided  
on for the house; they have removed the staircase and to keep the trim that is on the porch.  
New updated plans were submitted.  
Larry Bucciarelli made a motion to approve the changes as noted on plans labeled East Elevation  
A-8 dated 10/10/2019 which motion was seconded by Thano Schoppel and carried unanimously.

NEW ITEMS:

CHEER HALL GARAGE 20 Washington Spring Road Palisades, NY 78.19 / 1 / 17; R-22 zoning district	APPROVED AS SUBMITTED	HABR#19-20
---	--------------------------	------------

CANFIELD-PARRIS 61 Washington Spring Road Palisades, NY 78.18 / 1 / 17; R-40 zoning district	APPROVED AS SUBMITTED	HABR#19-21
---	--------------------------	------------

BARRIS RETAINING WALL & FENCE 80 Washington Spring Road Palisades, NY 78.18 / 1 / 12; R-22 zoning district	APPROVED AS SUBMITTED	HABR#19-22
--	--------------------------	------------

THE DECISIONS RELATED TO THE ABOVE HEARINGS are inserted herein and made part of these minutes.

There being no further business to come before the Board, on motion duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 8:15 P.M.

DATED: November 12, 2019

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW

BY:   
Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE  
2019 NOV 27 A 9:03  
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

DECISION

**GARAGE APPROVED AS PRESENTED**

TO: Andrea Currier (Cheer Hall LLC)  
4385 Old Tavern Road P.O. Box 516  
The Plains, VA 20198-0516

HABR #19-20  
November 12, 2019  
Permit #48996

FROM: HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR#19-20: Application of Cheer Hall LLC for review of a garage at a single-family residence. The premises are located at 20 Washington Spring Road, in the Town of Orangetown, Hamlet of Palisades, New York. Chapter 12 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown, Section 12-4(A), Historical Areas Board of Review.

Tax Map Designation: 78.19 / 1 / 17; R-22 zoning district.

Heard by the HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday, November 12, 2019 at which time the Board made the following determination:

Henry Rust, Architect, appeared.

The following documents were presented:

1. Architectural plans dated 08/30/2019 signed and sealed by Christian Louis Martos, Architect, labeled "Removal and Replacement of Existing Garage", T-1 Directory Vicinity Map Index & Notes. C-1 Site Plan, C-1.2 Street Scape, A-2 Plans, Notes Elevations & Schedules.

Henry Rust, Architect showed the board pictures of the existing structure and stated that it is listed as a non-contributing structure that was built around the 1950's; that it is not worth trying to salvage and when they rebuild it will be out of the existing drainage canal; that the bedroom above will be used by the family; that the materials for the garage will match the house and the lighting will be the same as the house; and the air conditioner will be tucked into the side and not visible to the neighbors.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

No public comment.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN  
2019 NOV 27 A 9 03  
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

**FINDINGS OF FACT:**

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), found as fact, that: The application as presented, would not adversely affect the Historical Areas and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed window and porch

1. The roof shall be aged cedar composite shake manufactured by Enviro Shake, Ontario, Canada.
2. The siding shall be white cedar beveled siding 5" exposure painted Benjamin Moore White (OC-61).
3. The soffits and fascia shall be wood or PVC white Benjamin Moore OC-61.
4. The gutters and leaders shall be natural copper.
5. The windows shall be Marvin Clad stone white by Marvin Windows.
6. The trim shall be wood as noted painted white Benjamin Moore oc-61.
7. The shutters shall be wood louvre operable custom made painted Essex Green by Benjamin Moore HC-188.
8. The outdoor lighting shall be black and or bronze traditional carriage lamps.
9. The walkways shall be blue stone.
10. The brick used for the foundation shall be Augusta Red Range Molded modular brick by Glen Gery Corporation.

**THIS APPROVAL/DECISION, INCLUDING THE BOARD'S REQUIRED MODIFICATIONS TO THE APPLICANT'S DRAWINGS AND /OR PLANS, OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH HEREIN, IF ANY, IS GRANTED BY THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW SUBJECT TO ANY SUCH CONDITIONS AND/OR MODIFICATIONS, AND IS LIMITED TO THE SPECIFIC RELIEF REQUESTED HEREIN.**

***\*\* PRE-1918 CONSTRUCTION: PLEASE BE ADVISED: IN THE HISTORIC AREA, ALL CONSTRUCTION REQUIRING A BUILDING PERMIT OR ANY EXTERIOR CHANGES (INCLUDING PAINT COLOR) TO BUILDINGS CONSTRUCTED PRIOR TO 1918, REQUIRES APPROVAL FROM THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW.***

**PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE HISTORICAL AREA BOARD OF REVIEW IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO ANY CHANGE OR MODIFICATION OF THE REQUIREMENTS AND/OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH IN THIS DECISION, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO:**

- ROOFING SHINGLES (IF CHANGING COLOR)
- SIDING
- DECORATIVE SIDING
- SOFFITS & FASCIA
- GUTTERS AND LEADERS
- WINDOWS
- TRIM
- SHUTTERS
- DOORS
- LIGHTING

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

2019 NOV 27 A 9:03

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

- LOCATION OF AIR CONDITIONING UNITS
- WALKWAYS, PATIOS
- POOLS, SPAS AND FENCES
- SIGNS
- ANY CHANGE IN THE ABOVE LIST INCLUDING COLOR, MATERIAL AND/OR MANUFACTURER

**IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE CONTACT DEBBIE ARBOLINO, CLERK TO THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW AT (845) 359-8410.**

DECISION: In view of the foregoing, and after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony before the Board, and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), the application for the garage is APPROVED.

The foregoing resolution to approve the split rail fence as presented was presented and moved by Larry Bucciarelli, seconded by Loren Plotkin; and carried as follows: Thano Schoppel, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; Larry Bucciarelli, aye; Carol Schelin, aye; Loren Plotkin, aye; and Scott Wheatley, aye. William Walther was absent.

The Administrative Aide to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk:

Dated: November 12, 2019

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW  
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

BY:   
Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT  
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS  
HABR MEMBERS  
SUPERVISOR  
TOWN ATTORNEY  
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY  
OBZPAE  
BUILDING INSPECTOR-G. M.

TOWN CLERK  
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT  
TOWN HISTORIAN  
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL  
ENGINEERING  
HABR, PB, FILE  
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE  
NOV 27 4 03  
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

DECISION

**APPROVED AS PRESENTED**

TO: Danielle Parris Canfield  
1686 34<sup>th</sup> Street NW  
Washington DC 20007

HABR #19- 21  
November 12, 2019  
Permit #49324

FROM: HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR#19-21: Application of Danielle Parris Canfield for review of a new dormer and tunnel reconstruction and a new garage roof at an existing single-family residence. The premises are located at 61 Washington Spring Road, in the Town of Orangetown, Hamlet of Palisades, New York. Chapter 12 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown, Section 12-4(A), Historical Areas Board of Review.

Tax Map Designation: 78.18 / 1 / 17; R-40 zoning district

Heard by the HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday, November 12, 2019 at which time the Board made the following determination:

Danielle Parris and John Matteo, Engineer, appeared.

The following documents were presented:

1. Architectural plans labeled “Parris-Canfield Residence Renovation” signed and sealed by John A. Matteo, P.E. (6 pages).
2. HABR# 18-15 dated October 9, 2018.

John Matteo, P.E., stated that the garage opens to the street; that the south side of the garage wall is cracked and shifted; that the retaining soil on the three sides have held up; that the roof collapsed but the diaphragm is structurally sound; that they are proposing to replicate the old flat roof and increase the capacity with steel and wood girders; that by re-establishing the diaphragm the south wall can be fixed; that the gambrel roof on the house is from north to south and the back bump out with the shed dormer will not be seen from the road; that the eave is approximately 4 feet in on the west elevation; that the casement windows are new but in keeping with the look of the old windows; that the east elevation will not be changes; that the new roof will be wood shingles to match the original roof; that the concrete tunnel from the garage to the house will be re-enforces concrete with landscaping and will not be noticed from the street; and the roof of the garage will be a rubber membrane with a green sedum succulents growing on it.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Gayle Shrady, 63 Washington Spring Road, asked what material would be used for the roof of the garage.

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE  
2019 NOV 27 A 9:03  
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

**FINDINGS OF FACT:**

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), found as fact, that: The application as presented, would not adversely affect the Historical Areas and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed new garage roof, tunnel and new dormer:

1. The house roof shall be yellow cedar Hicksville Plaining Mill.
2. The garage roof shall be flat rubber membrane with green sedum plantings.
3. The siding shall be white cream tone yellow cedar by Ottoson Fargmakeri (all lime paints).
4. The soffits and fascia shall be white cream tone Honduran Mahogany Hicksville Plaining Mill.
5. The gutters and leaders shall be copper by Hussey Copper.
6. The windows shall be white cream tone Honduran Mahogany by Parret.
7. The trim and shutters shall be white cream tone Honduran Mahogany by Hicksville Plaining Mill.
8. The front and back door shall be white cream tone Honduran Mahogany by Parret Ottoson Fargmakeri paint.
9. The garage doors shall be Hastings Grey Honduran Mahogany "overheard Door" Ottoson Fargmakeri.
10. All other doors shall be white cream tone Honduran Mahogany Ottoson Fargmakeri paint.
11. The lighting shall be First light Nautica Bra by First light Products with LED Edison Bulb 7 Watt -60 Watt Equal 90 Plus lighting.
12. The stone shall be natural Basalt and Bluestone sourced on site.

**THIS APPROVAL/DECISION, INCLUDING THE BOARD'S REQUIRED MODIFICATIONS TO THE APPLICANT'S DRAWINGS AND /OR PLANS, OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH HEREIN, IF ANY, IS GRANTED BY THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW SUBJECT TO ANY SUCH CONDITIONS AND/OR MODIFICATIONS, AND IS LIMITED TO THE SPECIFIC RELIEF REQUESTED HEREIN.**

***\*\* PRE-1918 CONSTRUCTION: PLEASE BE ADVISED: IN THE HISTORIC AREA, ALL CONSTRUCTION REQUIRING A BUILDING PERMIT OR ANY EXTERIOR CHANGES (INCLUDING PAINT COLOR) TO BUILDINGS CONSTRUCTED PRIOR TO 1918, REQUIRES APPROVAL FROM THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW.***

**PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE HISTORICAL AREA BOARD OF REVIEW IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO ANY CHANGE OR MODIFICATION OF THE REQUIREMENTS AND/OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH IN THIS DECISION, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO:**

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN  
NOV 27 9 03  
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

- ROOFING SHINGLES (IF CHANGING COLOR)
- SIDING
- DECORATIVE SIDING
- SOFFITS & FASCIA
- GUTTERS AND LEADERS
- WINDOWS
- TRIM
- SHUTTERS
- DOORS
- LIGHTING
- LOCATION OF AIR CONDITIONING UNITS
- WALKWAYS, PATIOS
- POOLS, SPAS AND FENCES
- SIGNS
- ANY CHANGE IN THE ABOVE LIST INCLUDING COLOR, MATERIAL AND/OR MANUFACTURER

**IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE CONTACT DEBBIE ARBOLINO, CLERK TO THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW AT (845) 359-8410.**


DECISION: In view of the foregoing, and after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony before the Board, and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports ( if any), the application for the New Dormer, Tunnel reconstruction and new garage roof is APPROVED.

The foregoing resolution to approve the wall and fence as presented was presented and moved by Thano Schoppel, seconded by Loren Plotkin; and carried as follows: Thano Schoppel, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; Larry Bucciarelli, aye; Carol Schelin, aye; Loren Plotkin, aye; and Scott Wheatley, aye. William Walther was absent.

The Administrative Aide to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: November 12, 2019

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW  
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

BY:   
Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT  
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS  
HABR MEMBERS  
SUPERVISOR  
TOWN ATTORNEY  
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY  
OBZPAE  
BUILDING INSPECTOR- M.M.

TOWN CLERK  
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT  
TOWN HISTORIAN  
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL  
ENGINEERING  
HABR, PB, FILE  
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE  
2019 NOV 27 A 9:03  
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN



DECISION

**APPROVED AS PRESENTED**

TO: Mary Barris  
80 Washington Spring Road  
Palisades , New York 10964

HABR #19- 22  
November 12, 2019  
Permit #49314

FROM: HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR#19-22: Application of Mary Barris for review of the repair of an existing wall and the installation of a fence on top of the wall at an existing single-family residence. The premises are located at 80 Washington Spring Road, in the Town of Orangetown, Hamlet of Palisades, New York. Chapter 12 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown, Section 12-4(A), Historical Areas Board of Review.

Tax Map Designation: 78.18 / 1 / 12; R-22 zoning district

Heard by the HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday, November 12, 2019 at which time the Board made the following determination:

William Bosley, Contractor, appeared.

The following documents were presented:

1. Copy of survey no title block with hand written additions by William Bosley.
2. Two pages of sketches of the proposed wall and fence by Bill Bosley dated 9/13/2019.

William Bosley testified that the south side of the Barris pool is where they would like to install the fence; that it would be installed about 10 feet from the property line and there would be a 2 foot knee wall and a five foot solid wood fence above it; that he appeared before the Zoning board and got approved for the variance; that recently there have been people pool hopping and the existing fence has been pulled down; that the fence would be about 75 foot long; and that there is holly planted in the area.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

No public comment.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN  
2019 NOV 27 A 9:03  
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

**FINDINGS OF FACT:**

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), found as fact, that: The application as presented, would not adversely affect the Historical Areas and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed wall and fence

1. The fence shall be constructed of antique barn siding.
2. The two foot knee wall shall be constructed of native stone and alcove.

**THIS APPROVAL/DECISION, INCLUDING THE BOARD'S REQUIRED MODIFICATIONS TO THE APPLICANT'S DRAWINGS AND /OR PLANS, OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH HEREIN, IF ANY, IS GRANTED BY THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW SUBJECT TO ANY SUCH CONDITIONS AND/OR MODIFICATIONS, AND IS LIMITED TO THE SPECIFIC RELIEF REQUESTED HEREIN.**

***\*\* PRE-1918 CONSTRUCTION: PLEASE BE ADVISED: IN THE HISTORIC AREA, ALL CONSTRUCTION REQUIRING A BUILDING PERMIT OR ANY EXTERIOR CHANGES (INCLUDING PAINT COLOR) TO BUILDINGS CONSTRUCTED PRIOR TO 1918, REQUIRES APPROVAL FROM THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW.***

**PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE HISTORICAL AREA BOARD OF REVIEW IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO ANY CHANGE OR MODIFICATION OF THE REQUIREMENTS AND/OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH IN THIS DECISION, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO:**

- ROOFING SHINGLES (IF CHANGING COLOR)
- SIDING
- DECORATIVE SIDING
- SOFFITS & FASCIA
- GUTTERS AND LEADERS
- WINDOWS
- TRIM
- SHUTTERS
- DOORS
- LIGHTING
- LOCATION OF AIR CONDITIONING UNITS
- WALKWAYS, PATIOS
- POOLS, SPAS AND FENCES
- SIGNS
- ANY CHANGE IN THE ABOVE LIST INCLUDING COLOR, MATERIAL AND/OR MANUFACTURER

**IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE CONTACT DEBBIE ARBOLINO, CLERK TO THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW AT (845) 359-8410.**

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN  
2019 NOV 27 A 9:03  
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

Barris  
HABR# 19-22  
Page 3 of 3

Permit #49314

DECISION: In view of the foregoing, and after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony before the Board, and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports ( if any), the application for the 2' knee wall and 5' solid wood fence above it is APPROVED.

The foregoing resolution to approve the wall and fence as presented was presented and moved by Scott Wheatley, seconded by Loren Plotkin; and carried as follows: Thano Schoppel, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; Larry Bucciarelli, aye; Carol Schelin, aye; Loren Plotkin, aye; and Scott Wheatley, aye. William Walther was absent.

The Administrative Aide to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: November 12, 2019

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW  
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

BY:   
Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT  
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS  
HABR MEMBERS  
SUPERVISOR  
TOWN ATTORNEY  
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY  
OBZPAE  
BUILDING INSPECTOR-M.M.

TOWN CLERK  
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT  
TOWN HISTORIAN  
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL  
ENGINEERING  
HABR, PB, FILE  
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN  
2019 NOV 27 A 9:03  
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE