

**MINUTES
HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
OCTOBER 9, 2018**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Margaret Raso
Larry Bucciarelli
Scott Wheatley
Carol Schelin
William Walther
Thano Schoppel

ABSENT: Loren Plotkin

ALSO PRESENT: Christian Catania, Senior Clerk Typist
Dennis Michaels, Deputy Town Attorney
Ann Marie Ambrose, Official Stenographer

Margaret Raso, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. Hearings on this meeting's agenda, which are made a part of this meeting, were held as noted below:

<u>APPLICANTS</u>	<u>DECISION</u>	<u>HABR#</u>
GARSCHINA/ STORY 23 Ludlow Lane Palisades, NY 80.06 / 1 / 30 & 31.1; R-80 zoning district	APPROVED AS PRESENTED	HABR#18-14
CANFIELD 61 Washington Spring Road Palisades, NY 78.18/ 1 / 17; R-80 zone	APPROVED AS PRESENTED	HABR#18-15
HYUN 54 Highland Avenue Palisades, NY 78.18 / 2 / 14; R-40 zone	CONTINUED	HABR#18-16

THE DECISIONS RELATED TO THE ABOVE HEARINGS are inserted herein and made part of these minutes.

There being no further business to come before the Board, on motion duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 8:30 P.M.

DATED: October 9, 2018

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW

BY: 
Deborah Arbolino
Administrative Aide

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2018 OCT 16 P 2:19
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

DECISION

APPROVED AS PRESENTED

TO: David Englander
23 Ludlow Lane (PO Box 594)
Palisades, New York
10964

HABR #18-14
October 9, 2018
Permit #47370

FROM: HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR#18-14: Application of Garschina/Story for review of a fence and gate at an existing single-family residence located at 23 Ludlow Lane, in the Town of Orangetown, Hamlet of Palisades, New York. Chapter 12 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown, Section 12-4(A), Historical Areas Board of Review.

Tax Map Designation: 80.06 / 1 / 30 & 31.1; R-80 zoning district

Heard by the HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday, October 9, 2018 at which time the Board made the following determination:

David Englander and Mark Strieter, Landscape Architect, appeared.

The following documents were presented:

1. As-Built Survey 23 and 31 Ludlow Lane by Cherry Weber Van Cleef Engineering Associates, P.C. dated 10/12/12 with the latest revision date of 05/09/2018.
2. Two 8 ½" x 11" black and white of the fence posts and gate.
3. A 8 ½" x 11" of the fence and rock wall.

David Englander, Attorney for Mr. Garschina stated that they were before the Board about five years ago; that there was a problem during construction and a change was made to the gate; that they are before the Board now to rectify the problem; that they are going to the Zoning Board after this for an amendment to the fence height; that he understands if the Zoning board makes any changes he will have to return to the Historical Areas Board of Review; that the deer fencing is black; the reason they need the gate is because the driveway is very long and people were driving all the way down the driveway and turning around directly in front of the house; that the gate is necessary to protect their privacy; and he has the previous decision and Mr. Walther made the motion to approve; and the fence height the last time was 4 ½'.

Mark Strieter, Landscape Architect, stated that the columns are stone and the modified version of the gate is made of natural materials , 2"x2" cedar that is grey and matches the stone; that the gate is 50' from the property line and the fence is 6' and he columns are 7 ½'; and there is more landscaping in the revised plan.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

No public comment.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2018 OCT 19 P 2:19
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), found as fact, that: The application as presented, would not adversely affect the Historical Areas and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed gate, pillars, fence and deer fence are as follows:

1. The fence gate is 2" x 2" clear cedar that has weathered to grey and the gate is set back 50' from the street.
2. The fence will be 6' high between natural stone columns that are 7 1/2' high.
3. The deer fence shall be black netting.

THIS APPROVAL/DECISION, INCLUDING THE BOARD'S REQUIRED MODIFICATIONS TO THE APPLICANT'S DRAWINGS AND /OR PLANS, OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH HEREIN, IF ANY, IS GRANTED BY THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW SUBJECT TO ANY SUCH CONDITIONS AND/OR MODIFICATIONS, AND IS LIMITED TO THE SPECIFIC RELIEF REQUESTED HEREIN.

***** PRE-1918 CONSTRUCTION: PLEASE BE ADVISED: IN THE HISTORIC AREA, ALL CONSTRUCTION REQUIRING A BUILDING PERMIT OR ANY EXTERIOR CHANGES (INCLUDING PAINT COLOR) TO BUILDINGS CONSTRUCTED PRIOR TO 1918, REQUIRES APPROVAL FROM THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW.***

PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO ANY CHANGE OR MODIFICATION OF THE REQUIREMENTS AND/OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH IN THIS DECISION, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO:

- ROOFING SHINGLES (IF CHANGING COLOR)
- SIDING
- DECORATIVE SIDING
- SOFFITS & FASCIA
- GUTTERS AND LEADERS
- WINDOWS
- TRIM
- SHUTTERS
- DOORS
- LIGHTING
- LOCATION OF AIR CONDITIONING UNITS
- WALKWAYS, PATIOS
- POOLS, SPAS AND FENCES
- SIGNS
- ANY CHANGE IN THE ABOVE LIST INCLUDING COLOR, MATERIAL AND/OR MANUFACTURER

IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE CONTACT DEBBIE ARBOLINO, CLERK TO THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW AT (845) 359-8410.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2018 OCT 19 P 2:19
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

DECISION: In view of the foregoing, and after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony before the Board, and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), the application for the entrance gate, columns, fence and black deer fence is APPROVED.

The foregoing resolution to approve the split rail fence as presented was presented and moved by William Walther, seconded by Larry Bucciarelli; and carried as follows: William Walther, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; Larry Bucciarelli, aye; Carol Schelin, aye; and Scott Wheatley, aye. Thano Schoppel was absent for this hearing. Loren Plotkin was absent.

The Administrative Aide to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: October 9, 2018

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

BY: 
Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS
HABR MEMBERS
SUPERVISOR
TOWN ATTORNEY
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY
OBZPAE
BUILDING INSPECTOR-M.M.

TOWN CLERK
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
TOWN HISTORIAN
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL
ENGINEERING
HABR, PB, FILE
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2018 OCT 16 P 2:19
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

DECISION

APPROVED AS PRESENTED

TO: Rex Lalire
304 Hudson Street
New York, NY 10013

HABR # 18-15
October 9, 2018
Permit #47999

FROM: HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR#18-15: Application of Thomas Canfield for review of a restoration and addition to an existing single-family residence located at 61 Washington Spring Road, in the Town of Orangetown, Hamlet of Palisades, New York. Chapter 12 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown, Section 12-4(A), Historical Areas Board of Review.

Tax Map Designation: 78.18 / 1 / 17; R-80 zoning district

Heard by the HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday, October 9, 2018 at which time the Board made the following determination:

Rex Lalire, Architect, appeared.

The following documents were presented:

1. Architectural plans dated 08/013/2018 revised 09/14/2018 signed and sealed by Rex P. Lalire, Architect, labeled "Canfield Residence" 12 pages.
2. Survey dated September 8, 1988 revised September 19, 1988 by Peter E. Roffino, P.L.S.

Rex Lalire, Architect, stated that the entire house is a restoration project and they did appear before the Board years ago but they did not include the addition of the sunroom on that project; that the windows have been sitting inside the structure and they plan to send them out for repair and want to save as many as possible; that the roof will be cedar shingles; the natural stone will be saved and used and repointed as necessary; the stone retaining wall will be reworked and saved; the white clapboard will be saved repaired and painted warm off-white Farrow and Ball Pointing #2003; the door will be painted Farrow and Ball Dark Blue named Drawing Room Blue #253; The air conditioning for the second floor will be fenced in with a wood fence; the lights at the front door will be traditional under soffit lights; the garage is not part of the project and an engineer needs to come in and check it for stability; and that he cannot speak to the location of the sewer or septic.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Blake Tovin, 60 Washington Spring Road, stated that he moved in 17 years ago; that the renovation on this house started and just stopped; that they have had problems with rodents and pests; that they would like assurance that the job will be completed in a reasonable time frame; that the garage is a major part of the property and if it is unsafe it should be removed; that the history of the project is that contractors start and don't get paid and walk away; that if the garage is not part of the project, can it just remain like it is with dilapidated walls/ the town should make them clean this up.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2018 OCT 16 P 2:19
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

Anonymous person stated that the plans are nice and they look great; that he would be happy to see the house occupied; that he hopes they finish the restoration this time; that it is a no brainer to approve this but if it doesn't get completed, it will negatively affect the community.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), found as fact, that: The application as presented, would not adversely affect the Historical Areas and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed restoration and addition: (Architectural plans dated 08/013/2018 revised 09/14/2018 signed and sealed by Rex P. Lalire, Architect, labeled "Canfield Residence" 12 pages; and Survey dated September 8, 1988 revised September 19, 1988 by Peter E. Roffino, P.L.S.

1. The roof shall be cedar shingles.
2. The siding shall be cedar clapboard painted warm off white Farrow & Ball # 2003 Pointing.
3. The soffit and fascia shall also be cedar painted warm off white Farrow & Ball # 2003 Pointing.
4. The gutters and leaders shall be copper.
5. The windows shall be restored, as many as possible; and the additional windows for the sunroom shall be painted wood windows with insulating glass and divided lites inside and out U.32 or better.
6. The front door shall be restored Dutch Door painted dark blue (Farrow & Ball # 253 Drawing Room Blue).
7. The lights by the front door shall be traditional surface soffit lights.
8. The stone on the structure shall be repointed and any new stone shall closely match the existing stone.
9. The air conditioning unit shall be surrounded by a wood fence

THIS APPROVAL/DECISION, INCLUDING THE BOARD'S REQUIRED MODIFICATIONS TO THE APPLICANT'S DRAWINGS AND /OR PLANS, OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH HEREIN, IF ANY, IS GRANTED BY THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW SUBJECT TO ANY SUCH CONDITIONS AND/OR MODIFICATIONS, AND IS LIMITED TO THE SPECIFIC RELIEF REQUESTED HEREIN.

***** PRE-1918 CONSTRUCTION: PLEASE BE ADVISED: IN THE HISTORIC AREA, ALL CONSTRUCTION REQUIRING A BUILDING PERMIT OR ANY EXTERIOR CHANGES (INCLUDING PAINT COLOR) TO BUILDINGS CONSTRUCTED PRIOR TO 1918, REQUIRES APPROVAL FROM THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW.***

PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE HISTORICAL AREA BOARD OF REVIEW IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO ANY CHANGE OR MODIFICATION OF THE REQUIREMENTS AND/OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH IN THIS DECISION, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO:

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2018 OCT 16 P 2:19
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

- ROOFING SHINGLES (IF CHANGING COLOR)
- SIDING
- DECORATIVE SIDING
- SOFFITS & FASCIA
- GUTTERS AND LEADERS
- WINDOWS
- TRIM
- SHUTTERS
- DOORS
- LIGHTING
- LOCATION OF AIR CONDITIONING UNITS
- WALKWAYS, PATIOS
- POOLS, SPAS AND FENCES
- SIGNS
- ANY CHANGE IN THE ABOVE LIST INCLUDING COLOR, MATERIAL AND/OR MANUFACTURER

IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE CONTACT DEBBIE ARBOLINO, CLERK TO THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW AT (845) 359-8410.


DECISION: In view of the foregoing, and after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony before the Board, and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), the application for the restoration and addition is APPROVED.

The foregoing resolution to approve the split rail fence as presented was presented and moved by Larry Bucciarelli, seconded by Thano Schoppel; and carried as follows: William Walther, aye; Thano Schoppel, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; Larry Bucciarelli, aye; Carol Schelin, aye; and Scott Wheatley, aye. Loren Plotkin was absent.

The Administrative Aide to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: October 9, 2018

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

BY: 
Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS
HABR MEMBERS
SUPERVISOR
TOWN ATTORNEY
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY
OBZPAE
BUILDING INSPECTOR-M.M.

TOWN CLERK
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
TOWN HISTORIAN
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL
ENGINEERING
HABR, PB, FILE
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2018 OCT 19 P 2:19
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE